7-2020

Temporality and acquiescent immobility among aspiring nurse migrants in the Philippines

Yasmin Y. ORTIGA
Singapore Management University, yasmino@smu.edu.sg

Romeo Luis A. MACABASAG

Temporality and acquiescent immobility among aspiring nurse migrants in the Philippines

Yasmin Y. Ortiga & Romeo Luis A. Macabasag
School of Social Sciences, Singapore Management University, Singapore, Singapore
National Telehealth Centre, University of the Philippines, Manila, Philippines

Corresponding author: yasmino@smu.edu.sg

Published in Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, June 2020, 99, Advance online, pp 1-16.
https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2020.1788380

Abstract

While there is a considerable literature on how people decide to move from their places of origin, few studies have examined how aspiring migrants cope with immobility and eventually decide to let go of their migration aspirations. This paper uses the lens of migration temporalities to show how Filipino nurses unable to emigrate overseas eventually chose to remain in the Philippines. In particular, we discuss how nurses formulated these decisions as they experienced different forms of temporality: from an optimistic period of 'becoming a migrant' in nursing school to the precarious temporality of building work experience in a context of staggered employment and short-term contracts. We discuss how interviewees who chose to let go of their migration aspirations came to view emigration in temporal terms as well: a short-term venture which may bring 'quick' benefits yet provide little opportunity for long term stability. We conclude the paper with a discussion of how a focus on time and temporalities can further complicate the discussion on immobility.

Keywords: Immobility, temporality, nursing, migration decisions, Philippines

In 2012, BBC News ran an article with the headline, 'Nursing Dream Turns Sour in the Philippines' (McGeown 2012). The article was one of many reporting on the downturn of overseas opportunities for Filipino nurses and its disastrous impact on the thousands of nursing graduates who had pursued the four-year degree in the hope of leaving the country.

The rise and fall of 'demand' for foreign nurse labour is not a new phenomenon (see Ortiga 2018b), yet, in a field largely focused on those who can and do move, few migration scholars have examined the experiences of aspiring nurse migrants who eventually remained in place (see Thompson 2018; Ortiga 2018a). 1 Existing studies on the immobility of nurses have centred on the structural barriers and state policies that constrain their ability to move across borders. For example, scholars attribute the most recent decline of opportunities for foreign nurses to the global financial crisis (Buchan, O'May, and Dussault 2013), and a visa processing backlog that ground to a halt Filipino nurse migration to the US in 2007 (Acacio 2011).

Yet, recent migration research has shown that while broader social structures can block or facilitate movement across borders, individuals create their migration aspirations and decide how to pursue them (Carling 2002; Creighton 2013; Carling and Schewel 2018). In many ways, the BBC article featuring 'immobile' Filipino nurses leaves open the question of what happens when people's migration aspirations 'turn sour' – an expression used to refer to something that had come to disappoint or fail. While there is a considerable literature on how individuals choose to move from their places of origin (see Frohlick 2009; Walsh 2009; Tabor, Milfont, and Ward 2015), few studies examine how people come to the 'decision to stay' (Schewel 2015, 10).

At the same time, the notion of migration aspirations 'souring' conjures the image of food that is about to be spoiled – curdling and fermenting to a point where it can no longer be consumed. In many ways, one can extend this metaphor in thinking about how the decision to remain in place occurs over a period of time, as initial plans start to clot and congeal amid the pressures of external challenges. To date, researchers have tended to treat the temporal as a subordinate element in discussions of space and spatiality – one that is recognised as part of the migration process, but seldom explicitly theorised (Meeus 2012). While scholars such as Hein De Haas (2010) have underlined the need to examine how migration decisions shift through time, fewer studies have looked at how temporality defines how people can forego previous aspirations of leaving their countries of origin. How can a temporal perspective help migration scholars understand why people eventually do not move? As migration dreams sour, how do individuals decide whether to start from scratch, with new dreams and intentions, or to pursue other endeavours?

This paper seeks to address these two questions by using the lens of migration temporalities in understanding the experiences of aspiring migrants coping with their inability to embark on international migration. In particular, we argue that even when individuals face serious barriers to movement, accepting one's international immobility is not a passive 'giving up' of migration dreams and desires. Rather, an attention to temporal subjectivities reveals how acquiescing to immobility is actually a more active process, where aspiring migrants take stock of both past efforts and future possibilities in order to decide whether to let go of their plans of leaving the country. We base our arguments on the case of Filipino nurses who, at the time of our study, were unable to realise their overseas aspirations due to the narrowing of opportunities in destination countries like the US, and the oversupply of nursing graduates within the Philippines (Acacio 2011; Ortiga 2018b). In particular, we examine how the decision to stay develops as nurses experience different forms of temporality: from an optimistic period of 'becoming a migrant' in nursing school to the precarious temporality of building work experience in a context of staggered employment and short-term contracts. We discuss how interviewees who chose to let go of their migration aspirations came to view emigration in temporal terms as well: a short-term venture which may bring 'quick' benefits yet provide little opportunity for long term stability. We conclude the paper with a discussion of how a focus on time and temporalities can further complicate the discussion on (im)mobility.

Time, temporalities, and migrant subjectivities

Temporality can be described as flows of discrete and related events, moments, or points in life (Griffiths, Rogers, and Anderson 2013, 15) geared towards achieving a specific becoming or future (Cole 2010). We situate this study in a growing literature on how temporality shapes migrants' subjectivities or their sense of self (see Griffiths, Rogers, and Anderson 2013; Baas and Yeoh 2018). Scholars have argued that examining subjectivities allows us to understand how people's ideas and actions are products of their interactions with 'other' individuals, institutions, and circumstances, regardless of spatial and temporal location (i.e. near or remote, or in the past, present, or future) (Conradson and McKay 2007). Existing studies have provided a rich analysis of the temporal subjectivities of immigrants, largely shaped by changing visa regimes and the stilted and unpredictable journey of seeking overseas opportunity (see Anderson 2009; Stevens 2018). For example, Shanthi Robertson (2019) emphasises how immigrants' subjectivity can vary depending on 'multiple scales of time', as state agencies, workplaces, and family impose different demands on individuals as they go through the migration process. Meanwhile, extensive work on irregular migrants highlight how changing temporalities can be psychologically taxing, as time shifts from being 'frozen' in prolonged periods of waiting to extremely rushed as deportation risks grow (see Andersson 2014; Griffiths 2014). These studies show how temporal experiences affect how immigrants reflect, cope, and respond to broader events that shape their migration journeys.

In contrast, there have been relatively fewer studies on the temporal subjectivity of aspiring migrants or those who have not yet been able to leave their countries of origin. A special issue in this journal discussed how an attention to temporality complicates how we determine individuals' migration decisions, given that aspirations to leave one's country of origin can be constant or fleeting, as individual circumstances change (Carling and Collins 2018). 2 In particular, some studies reveal how individuals come to imagine an ideal future linked to emigration (Bailey et al. 2002; Cole 2010) which affects how they view their experiences at the present – in some cases, discouraging aspiring migrants from investing in their current situations (Ali 2007; Chu 2010).

More broadly, Francis Collins (2017) discusses how migration 'desires' bring together multiple temporalities, as individuals embark on different projects in order to realise the goal of leaving their places of origin. Rather than focus on particular aspirations, Collins proposes the notion of 'desire' as a broader concept that includes both conscious and sub-conscious factors that influence how individuals work towards emigration.

While important, these studies have mostly focused on the question of how migration comes about and how temporality shapes the drivers of emigration (Carling and Collins 2018). Even fewer scholars have looked deeply into how time also defines how some aspiring migrants eventually choose not to leave at all. Previous research has centred on the emotional consequences of the various forms of temporalities (e.g. deceleration, discontinuities) experienced by aspiring migrants who are unable to move (Robertson and Runganaikaloo 2014; Kara 2016; Wang 2020). Yet, in most of these studies, immobility is imposed upon individuals, mainly in the form of structural barriers and a lack of social and economic resources (Jónsson 2008; Castles, De Haas, and Miller 2013; Mata-Codesal 2017).

In this paper, we investigate how individual experiences and perceptions of time can shape their experiences of immobility, pushing some to eventually let go of their original aspirations to emigrate. While we discuss the structural constraints that impact aspiring migrants' migration journeys, we also emphasise the need to show individual agency drives the formation of these temporal subjectivities. In doing so, we bring the temporal lens to the aspiration-capability model of international migration (Carling 2002; Schewel 2019). This model defines migration in two steps: (1) how people evaluate emigration as 'a potential course of action' and (2) whether they are able to realise this decision at a particular period in time (Carling and Schewel 2018, 947). Some individuals may aspire to emigrate but lack the ability to do so, rendering their immobility as involuntary. In contrast, immobility may also be voluntary, as people may have no desire to leave their current locations even if they have the capacity to move (Carling 2002). Between these two extremes are those who do not have the ability to move, yet no longer harbour any aspirations to do so. Schewel (2015) terms this condition as acquiescent immobility, signalling an acceptance of one's inability to realise initial plans to emigrate. Proponents of the aspiration-capability model have placed these different forms of immobility along a spectrum, where time accounts for where individuals may be currently situated. As Schewel (2019, 9) argued, 'because one's resources and desires change over time, one's place along these spectrums changes too'.

However, empirical research using this model has yet to examine how temporality or the subjective experience of time explains how aspiring migrants move from one form of immobility to another. While the aspiration-capability model recognises both the structure and agency that shapes people's movement, empirical studies in the current literature are more likely to portray aspiring migrants as passive actors faced with varying levels of challenges and constraints (see for exception Schewel 2015; Mainwaring 2016). With the exception of those who are voluntarily immobile, the terms 'acquiescent' and 'involuntary' connotes that remaining in place is something that just happens to people who fail to realise their migration projects. The following sections discuss how aspiring migrants in the Philippines actively assess their own immobility in facing unrelenting structural barriers to their future emigration.

Context: Filipino nurses and the migration trap

There is a long history of nurse migration from the Philippines, beginning in the early 1900s, when American colonial officials established the first nursing schools in the country (Choy 2003). However, the current training and deployment of Filipino nurses for foreign employers is a more recent phenomenon, as growing healthcare needs within developed nations led to a worldwide demand for migrant nurse labour (Guevarra 2010; Yeates and Pillinger 2019). In the early 2000s, hospitals in the US had become particularly aggressive in recruiting foreign nurses, with policymakers predicting a labour shortage of close to 1 million nurses by 2020 (Aiken 2007). While western nations like the US and UK were the most popular destinations, the majority of Filipino nurse migrants also left for jobs in destinations within Asia and the Middle East. Most of these contracts were temporary, with no chance of permanent settlement (Peñafiel 2015; Vilog and Ballesteros 2015; Amrith 2020). Such global 'demand' prompted the Philippine nursing schools to expand the 'production' of nurses, enrolling thousands of students eager to use the nursing degree as a steppingstone towards overseas work (Ortiga 2018a).

As opportunities for Filipino nurses in the US and Europe declined after 2008, nursing graduates found themselves caught in a migration trap, a phenomenon where aspiring migrants obtain specific credentials in the hope of working overseas but are unable to leave when labour demands or immigration requirements change (Ortiga 2018b). As discussed in the introduction, a backlog of immigrant visa applications in the mid-2000s stopped the outflow of Filipino nurses to the US (Acacio 2011), while the financial crisis in 2008 reduced migrant nurse hires on a global scale (ICNM 2012). Lacking public funds, Philippine hospitals could not offer permanent positions to the massive number of nursing graduates within the country, leaving many unemployed and unable to gain the clinical work experience needed for jobs in alternative destinations like Japan and Singapore. Recent years have seen a number of studies on the experiences of nurses 'left behind', focused mainly on their experiences of involuntary immobility (see Thompson 2018; Ortiga 2018b). Our findings underline nurses' decision to stay in place.

Method

This paper emerges from our own engagements with questions of nurse labour and migration. As a sociologist interested in higher education issues, the first author had been conducting research on how Philippine universities attempt to educate aspiring nurse migrants for 'export' to foreign employers. Witnessing the massive expansion of nursing schools prompted her to investigate the experiences of aspiring migrants after graduation, particularly those who have been unable to obtain jobs overseas. For the second author, questions about nurses' international immobility stemmed from personal experience. As a registered nurse himself, he initially planned on working overseas and saw first-hand the difficulty of finding jobs that would 'count' towards hospital jobs abroad. Having given up on his original migration aspirations, he sought to understand how other nurses decided to stay in the Philippines and how this affected their professional identities. This paper brings together our separate interests and raises the question of how nurses' temporal experiences after nursing school shape their own migration aspirations.

This paper draws from in-depth interviews with 30 Filipino nursing graduates who, at the time of our interviews, were working in the Philippines (see Table 1). We recruited participants through contacts we had established in our previous research work. The first author was conducting a study in Philippine nursing schools and asked clinical instructors to recommend former students and friends. The second author recruited nurses he met while conducting field work in rural hospitals and health centres. Research participants' ages ranged from 22 to 35 years old. All our participants had passed the Philippine Nursing Board examinations and were licensed as registered nurses. While we did not directly ask nurses about their socioeconomic status, we could surmise that our interviewees were relatively privileged, given that Nursing is one of the most expensive majors in Philippine universities (Ortiga 2018a). However, it is important to note that none of our interviewees had graduated from the country's elite nursing schools. Instead, they attended lower-tier private institutions where fees were considerably cheaper. More than half of our interviewees also shared that their school expenses were 'sponsored' by a relative overseas. As we will discuss later, the notion of having to 'repay' family members for sponsoring their expensive degrees was a large factor in our interviewees' decision to pursue overseas work.

We conducted these interviews at different periods between 2015 and 2018. At the time of this study, all our interviewees were based in the Philippines. 3 None of them had been able to realise their initial goal of emigrating as professional nurses. Less than a third (9 out of the 30) of our interviewees were still actively working towards pursuing their plans of finding nursing jobs overseas. For those who had let go of their migration aspirations, the time that had passed since their decision to stay varied widely and ranged from one to six years. In our findings section, we explain that time (in terms of number of years/months) was less of a deciding factor in terms of when our interviewees decided to accept their inability to leave the country as professional nurses. Rather, a more salient reason behind this decision was how aspiring nurse migrants viewed their own trajectory and the amount of time they would have to continue to invest in their migration dreams.

Table 1. Descriptive data of interview participants.

	n
Gender	
Male	6
Female	24
Year registered as professional nurse	
2005	1
2006	–
2007	1
2008	5
2009	2
2010	2
2011	3
2012	7
2013	4
2014	1
2015	3
2016	1
Pursued nursing degree to work overseas	
Yes	26
No	4
Maintains aspirations to work **overseas**	
Yes, as a nurse	5
Yes, but not as a nurse	4
Not at all	21

We acknowledge that some of our interviewees' international immobility may be temporary. Changing circumstances may reignite desires to leave the country and other researchers have shown how many Filipino nursing graduates have sought alternative pathways to emigration (see Kofman 2004; Ortiga 2018b). 4 However, we believe that there is still value in investigating how aspiring migrants come to let go (even temporarily) of their desires to leave the country. In the case of nursing, such decisions can have serious implications on how much more time aspiring migrants will need if ever they decide to restart their goals of seeking jobs overseas, given the multitude of tests and work experience requirements needed (see Walton-Roberts 2020).

All interviews were conducted in Tagalog and later translated to English. We asked questions about interviewees' motivations for pursuing a nursing degree, the job search after graduation, their experiences working in different health- and non-health care facilities; and their considerations in deciding to stay in the Philippines. We initially coded our interviews in terms of the challenges our participants' experienced in working toward emigration: their studies in nursing school, work experience, and family concerns. As we deepened our analysis, we realised that participants often used their perceptions of time in recounting how they navigated structural constraints and formulated their migration decisions. We recoded our interviews based on how our participants use the notion of time in describing the different stages of their migration journeys, as well as how they cope with the practical and emotional challenges they encountered.

Building and letting go of the nurse-migrant self

This section discusses two major phases in the evolution of our interviewees' subjectivities as aspiring nurse migrants: the four-year period of professionalisation in pursuit of the nursing degree and the process of building their clinical experience after passing the Philippine nurse board examination. We do not deny that within each of these phases, interviewees may have gone through a wide range of temporal experiences,

where time may have felt compressed, disjointed, or stretched out. 5 In organising this section in terms of these two major phases, we emphasise the contrast in how our participants perceived their sense of self, and how their general experience of temporality during this period eventually impacted their migration aspirations.

Nursing education: ripening the image of the future migrant self

For the majority of our interviewees, the decision to pursue a Nursing degree was driven by a desire to work and live overseas. Few of our interviewees developed such aspirations on their own, with family members encouraging them to use nursing as a means of leaving the country (Choy 2003; Ortiga 2018a). For instance, Daizhel, a registered nurse since 2013, initially considered becoming an accountant because she considered accountancy a well-paid profession in the Philippines. However, during her last year in high school, her parents insisted that she study nursing instead. Similar to the patterns of chain migration common among migrant families, 6 Daizhel's parents wanted to follow other relatives who had already moved to Canada.

Our interviewees explained that their families' insistence on nursing came at a time when foreign nurse recruitment was at a high. Parents wanted their children to take advantage of this opportunity, even if the latter had no expressed interest in the field. So while our interviewees may have thought of pursuing different careers before they entered university, they eventually adopted the goal of becoming a migrant nurse upon the advice and encouragement of their family members. 7 As Jean, a registered nurse since 2008, explained,

> I trusted the advice of my parents and relatives. I am the eldest child of my parents, as well as the eldest grandchild of my grandparents. The pressure is on me to perform well … I took up nursing, and I told myself that once I became a nurse, I will also work abroad.

Even if interviewees may have entered nursing programmes with only a vague idea of what the profession entailed, their college education proved to be a time when interviewees ripened their migration aspirations, solidifying their image of a future self they hoped to embody (Alpes 2014; Folke 2017).

On the one hand, this process of becoming meant developing an identity as a professional nurse. For Jessa, a registered nurse since 2015, the feeling of 'being a nurse' only came in the second year of her nursing programme. She would have preferred to major in psychology instead, but her parents convinced her to follow the footsteps of an uncle who was a military nurse in Saudi Arabia. Jessa was fairly unmotivated in nursing school until hospital exposure helped her develop a stronger interest in the profession,

> I think things changed when we started going on duty in the hospital and started taking care of patients … I like that I get to attach the catheter, things like that … And when we started working in the charity wards, it felt really nice to have relatives thank you for taking care of their loved ones. I think it was this experience that triggered my desire to really become a nurse.

On the other hand, the development of a professional nursing identity also came with strong pressures to pursue aspirations for overseas work. In this sense, interviewees' time at nursing school was not only about learning to be a professional nurse but also becoming a future migrant nurse. Nursing school administrators steered classroom curriculum towards preparing students for foreign employers, offering courses that were deemed 'useful' for nurses to work in places like the US (e.g. geriatric nursing) even if such specialisations were less needed in Philippine healthcare institutions (Masselink and Lee 2010; Ortiga 2014). Nursing educators also reinforced students' migration aspirations, counselling them on immigration requirements and which countries were likely to recruit foreign nurses when they graduate. As such, even students who did not enter nursing with defined plans to emigrate eventually developed strong aspirations for working overseas. For example, Kimberly, a registered nurse since 2012, had always been fascinated with the healthcare profession given that her mother, while not a nurse, had worked in the local hospital. She recalled playing with syringes and other clinical equipment, pretending to treat 'patients' as a child. Yet, it was only in nursing school that she became more conscious of how nursing could be an important stepping stone towards a lucrative career overseas.

> At that time – it was 2007 – there were so many students taking nursing … Everyone was thinking about going abroad, about dollars, money. So I started to think, "Ah, when I graduate, I'll be able to earn a lot of money!" Your mindset changes as a nursing student. Suddenly, it became all about going overseas.

The transformation of Kimberly's aspirations, from simply working as a nurse to becoming a migrant nurse reinforces Carling and Collins' (2018) argument that individual views towards the possible emigration are rooted in social institutions and contexts. We emphasise that such aspirations are also dependent on our interviewees' imagined future, one which only becomes clearer as they go through a nurse education system driven towards preparing them for overseas jobs. 8

Unfortunately, our interviewees' emigration plans faced immediate challenges upon graduation. If nursing school was a period of creating and enhancing the possibility of one's future migrant self, navigating the job market after graduation was a precarious time of short-term contracts and instability that made such dreams suddenly less viable.

Precarious temporality: high aspirations, diminishing ability

After obtaining their nursing degrees and passing the Philippines' nursing board examinations, the next step towards obtaining overseas work was to seek employment in a hospital setting. Foreign employers in desired destinations like the US and Canada required nurse migrants to have at least two years of hospital work experience in order to maintain a 'safe window of practice' before moving overseas (Ronquillo et al. 2011; Thompson and Walton-Roberts 2019). Employers had varying requirements as to the size and bed-capacity of these hospitals, but there was a general sentiment that the 'tertiary' level institutions were the most ideal, given that these settings were most similar to hospitals in developed nations.

Yet, by the mid-2000s, nurses found it extremely difficult to find jobs in any hospital – whether it was the largest national health institution or the smallest municipal health centre (Ortiga 2018b). 9 As noted in earlier sections, the decline in overseas jobs had saturated the Philippine labour market with thousands of nursing graduates desperate for clinical experience. As such, interviewees found themselves among many other young graduates with similar degrees, trying to vie for limited positions. Jean recalled how the lack of jobs came as a shock, given her own success in hurdling across the challenges of nursing school.

> I graduated in 2008 and I passed the board exams two months after. One take. Mama was so proud. She said it must have really been God's will because we did not even make an offering at the church. I didn't even enrol in a review centre … Then, after a short vacation, I started to look for work. That is when the struggle began. I would try to apply to hospitals and they wouldn't even let me see the human resources department. We had to leave our CVs with the security guard at the hospital entrance. There were just too many nurses.

While Philippine public hospitals had long been understaffed, they lacked the funds needed to offer permanent positions to nursing graduates. Instead, government hospitals pooled the names of applicants in a lottery drum and picked a small number to be awarded three-month employment contracts. Sadly, even nursing graduates who 'won' these contracts could not make sustained progress towards their migration goals. The short-term nature of such jobs meant that interviewees' work record was not 'continuous', and therefore ineligible for the kind of work experience that employers required. Maylene, a registered nurse since 2011, recalled,

> I used to work in a public hospital that gave us 3-month contracts … I really worked a total of six months but I had to do it in two separate periods that were three months each. The hospital would offer you one three-month contract when you entered then you would need to "rest" first before you could reapply again for another three months.

The situation was worse in private hospitals, where administrators also took advantage of the large number of applicants by requiring nurses to 'volunteer' their services as probationary employees before hiring them (see Ronquillo et al. 2011; Thompson 2018; Ortiga 2018b). Often disguised as a form of 'postgraduate training',

volunteer nurses were required to work in regular shifts, stay overtime to accomplish unfinished tasks, and at times, work during weekends and holidays. Many of our interviewees eventually left, fed up with hospitals' unfulfilled promise of regular employment. Karlyn, a registered nurse since 2012, shared,

> Before I passed the board exams, I tried volunteering at a small hospital near our house. They said they would give me a regular position once I passed but they never did. Ang tagal na, hinihintay namin [We just kept waiting and waiting] … Even worse, the volunteers were doing the same work as the regular nurses! I was so tired, I just left.

It is important to note that there were other nursing positions beyond hospital work that provided more stable wages. A number of our interviewees joined rural health programmes as community health workers, while others worked as nurses for schools and private companies. However, interviewees preferred not to remain in such 'non-clinical' jobs for very long, mainly because recruitment agencies and foreign employers did not count such work as 'relevant' experience.

Thus, the lack of stable nursing jobs within the Philippines placed interviewees in a period of precarious temporality (O'Kerry 2017; Stevens 2018), where it became difficult for them to imagine where they would be in the future, or if they would ever fulfil their aspirations of leaving the country. While nursing school fostered a positive, smoothly continuous and optimistic view of their futures as migrant nurses, interviewees described their time after graduation as 'putol-putol' or cut up into incoherent, disparate pieces. This lack of continuity prolonged our interviewees' state of involuntary immobility (Carling 2002). Their migration aspirations compelled them to relentlessly pursue experience and credentials that could build their CVs, in case opportunities overseas opened up once again (Ortiga 2018b). However, the precarious job market made it difficult to create a narrative of continuous work for foreign employers. Oriented towards an imagined future of emigration, nursing graduates were caught in a 'transitional stage or condition' (Cwerner 2001, 27), where they were neither confident in their ability to work overseas nor secure enough to settle down permanently in the Philippines. Weena, a registered nurse since 2015, bitterly summed up the disconnect between the aspirations she had in nursing school, and the difficulties she encountered after graduation.

> When you're still in college, you just assume that you would go abroad after you graduated … You don't realize that you will go through hell just looking for a job. And even if you find one, you will not be able to get a regular position as nursing staff.

As periods of precarious temporality grew longer, so did nurses' uncertainty in imagining their future migrant selves. In the next section, we discuss how interviewees took stock of their progress towards fulfilling their migration aspirations, assessing whether they could still imagine themselves as nurses working overseas. Consequently, we will demonstrate how the precarious temporalities shaped our interviewees' aspiring migrants' subjectivities, eventually defining their migration trajectories and decisions.

'Long-term investment': letting go of migration aspirations

Out of the 30 nurses we interviewed, 21 interviewees shared that they had let go of their imagined future as a migrant nurse. Taken at face value, it is easy to assume that their decision to stay was a form of acquiescent immobility (Schewel 2015). The previous sections show that none of the nurses we spoke to had been able to attain the required length of work experience that would qualify them for hospitals in their desired destinations. At the time of our interviews, opportunities for foreign nurses were also still limited in desired destination countries (i.e. US and Canada). However, the 21 nurses we interviewed also claimed that they no longer aspired to leave the country. In this sense, they had acquiesced to their inability to emigrate as they had planned.

Yet, we found that the nurses' decision to let go of their migration aspirations was not simply a passive acceptance of their immobility. Rather, our interviewees actively assessed the resources and time they invested in pursuing their initial dreams of leaving the country. It is also important to note that aspiring nurse migrants did not simply weigh these different factors at one point in time. Just as our interviewees formulated

their early migration aspirations based on a vision of their future migrant self, the decision to stay emerged from a tension between the desire for stability and the promise that emigration offers.

During their nursing education, interviewees regarded overseas work as a quick way to earn money and live a more comfortable life. Yet, after struggling through the precarious job market for nurses, most of them came to see emigration as another short-term contract, without the security of tenure. In this sense, the decision to stay stemmed from the emergence of stronger desires for other life goals – one of them being the possibility of obtaining a job with more stability and benefits. Joanne shared that this desire for stability was the reason she accepted a permanent job in her town's rural health unit. Having passed the board exams in 2016, Joanne was relatively younger than our other interviewees and family members expressed surprise that she had given up on her migration aspirations so early. Joanne's sister-in-law even offered to help her find work as a live-in caregiver in Israel, but she declined, arguing that she preferred to keep her government position.

> People ask me why I don't just go overseas … but for me, I think of my decision to stay as an investment. If you want an investment that will grow quickly and bring you a lot of money right away, going abroad is the best way to go. But if you want a long-term investment (emphasis added), it is better to go with a permanent government job. I'm a woman. I want to get married and have kids. If I were abroad, I would have to stop work and go home … It makes sense to stay.

On the surface, Joanne's metaphor of emigration as an 'short-term investment' can be assumed to reflect a simple cost-and-benefit analysis of potential wages across different places. While money is an important factor in any form of labour migration, Joanne's statement also shows how she is investing in other future selves that include non-economic factors such as her desire to be a wife and a mother. She is cognizant that the majority of Filipino nurse migrants take on short-term labour contracts whose benefits might be only temporary. As such, her government job serves as a more stable path to take in achieving her goals. Kimberly echoed this sentiment, arguing that since she became a public health nurse in her hometown, she has been at peace with the comfort of living near her family.

> Sometimes I do wonder what it would be like if I went abroad. But I'll only think about it for maybe one minute. I have a lot of friends who went overseas and what I see is that while you earn a lot while you have your contract, after your contract ends, you're back to zero. I like my job. I find it fulfilling. I don't earn a lot but I have a regular position that allows me to take care of my parents. I think this is enough.

Both Joanne and Kimberly had initially imagined themselves as migrant nurses. They invested in their nursing degrees and laboured for free in provincial hospitals. Yet, their desire for long-term stability also came with their shift towards other subjectivities – that as children to aging parents, or as parents themselves. At the beginning of their nursing education, it was easy to imagine a future self that lived and worked in far off countries, providing for family members back home. As time passed and parents began to age, interviewees reassessed their migration aspirations with a vision for the future that went beyond simply earning more money. In this sense, their immobility was no longer involuntary, but it was not a passive acquiescence to their inability to emigrate either.

However, not all of our interviewees had the privilege of moving to more stable jobs. Permanent positions in Philippine health institutions continue to be extremely rare so while some interviewees were also tired of moving from one precarious job to another, the lack of more stable alternatives within the country kept them working towards emigration. In such cases, the pursuit of emigration seemed like a more promising 'investment' to make. This tension was evident in Yeng's decision to leave her position at the rural health unit, despite her supervisor offering to increase her salary. Yeng declined the job because it was only a temporary position and returned to looking for hospital work, even if these contracts were shorter and salaries were much lower.

> I can't grow old [in the community] … I can't grow old without ever having a permanent job. I know that if I go abroad, the jobs will not be permanent either. But at least your salary can help you provide more for your family.

For other interviewees, the decision to stay also stemmed from an assessment of how much longer they could sustain the pursuit of their migration aspirations. Here, time was also a major part of our interviewees' reflections, in particular: How much time had they invested? How much time did they have left for other personal goals? And more importantly, how much more time were they willing to devote towards accumulating the resources needed for overseas work? For some, this process of deciding when to 'give up' was often a seesaw of emotions that went on for years. Karlyn, a registered nurse since 2012, had initially given up on both emigration and nursing as a profession. After a series of temporary stints in different hospitals, she considered becoming a public school teacher and even returned to her university to major in Education. She confessed, 'It was like a mid life crisis – ay, no, I mean a mid-20s crisis (laughs). I just felt like I couldn't – I mean, I got scared that I would never find a permanent job in the future'. Yet, after two years, Karlyn returned to nursing practice when she was offered a temporary position at a rural health unit. When pressed on why she decided to continue her efforts at trying to emigrate, Karlyn said she felt that she still had time to do so, and it was 'too early' to give up so easily.

For other interviewees, such decisions were made in shorter periods of time. Nurses such as John, a registered nurse since 2012, started running his family's electronic business after six months in a private hospital. Realising that his 10,000-peso salary would keep him dependent on his parents and unable to marry his girlfriend, he decided to leave the nursing profession and his initial migration dreams. Previous studies have shown how a large number of Filipino nursing graduates now fill a wide range of non-nursing jobs in the Philippine domestic labour market, from real estate to call centre agencies (Thompson 2018; Ortiga 2020). While some view this change of career as a positive move towards other opportunities, others regard their departure from the profession as an inability to continue enduring a life of precarious work and poor wages.

In the end, feelings of doubt and regret were common, among both those who decided to stay and those who continue to work towards leaving. Taking stock of one's progress towards emigration meant also coming to terms with the possibility that the time spent in pursuing such goals would be wasted or unjustified by the eventual outcome. Some interviewees questioned whether it was worth allocating so much of their lives into becoming the ideal migrant nurse.

Meanwhile, those who left the profession expressed bitterness in being unable to use the skills they had spent so much time perfecting at school and at work. Interviewees who continue to strive for overseas jobs worried that their imagined future overseas may never be fully realised. Yet, they also felt compelled to continue a journey they had started so many years ago.

Conclusion

The BBC article discussed in this paper's introduction amplified an unfortunate reality for many aspiring migrants: immigration restrictions and structural inequalities can make emigration dreams turn sour, forcing them to consider whether such aspirations are still worth pursuing. The stories of the Filipino nurses we encountered in our research speak to a growing call for migration scholars to look beyond subjects of mobility, and redirect attention on the many others who do not move (see Hannam, Sheller, and Urry 2006; Mata-Codesal 2015; Schewel 2019). Based on our interviewees' narratives, this paper brings a temporal approach to our understanding of international immobility.

The case of aspiring nurse migrants show how individual perceptions of time play an integral role in how they assess and cope with their international immobility – one that might seem more acquiescent than involuntary, but at the same time, more active than passive. While structural forces had initially constrained nurses' ability to leave, the decision to stay was mostly borne out of interviewees' subjective views of their ideal future selves and their personal trajectories towards their initial migration to leave the country. Similar to Collins' (2017) work on aspiring migrants' desires, the Filipino nurses in our study lived through multiple temporalities, folded together in their initial pursuit of overseas jobs. Our interviewees ripened the image of their future migrant selves in nursing school, witnessed the souring of these original aspirations as they got caught in the migration trap, and suffered through an extended period of precarious employment that slowed their progress towards their emigration dreams. We argue that as interviewees took stock of these experiences, they came to assess the act of emigration in temporal terms as well. From a quick shot at bettering one's life

chances, overseas work becomes another short-term contract, much like the many temporary nursing jobs in the Philippines. As the original migration dream sours, other goals and aspirations become more palatable, one of which is the notion of remaining in place. All of these highlight Baas and Yeoh's (2018) argument for scholars to utilise concepts of time and temporality, not only in explaining people's migration trajectories but also different experiences of immobility. As noted by Griffiths, Rogers, and Anderson (2013), a temporal framing of individual subjectivities explains the variability of migration decisions.

At the same time, we acknowledge that the letting go of one's migration aspirations is not a choice that all nurses are free to take, nor is it one that is necessarily set in stone. While some of our interviewees could choose to forego their migration aspirations, our findings also highlight the problems of Filipino nurses who no longer want to emigrate, yet find that there are no 'long-term' alternatives available to them within the Philippines. As noted earlier, feelings of doubt and regret tinge nurses' reflections of their current situations: whether they acquiesced to their immobility or remain driven towards moving overseas. Megha Amrith (2020) argues that migration pathways are often non-linear, where progress can stop and start at different points, or cycle back to places that had supposedly been left behind. We acknowledge that things can also change for aspiring nurse migrants if structural constraints are loosened and they find themselves with future opportunities to leave. In fact, we write this piece in the middle of an ongoing COVID-19 pandemic, where opportunities for foreign nurses have suddenly opened up in receiving nations grappling with a need for more healthcare workers (Solomon 2020).

In many ways, this paper is not meant to prove the finality of one's decision to stay, but rather show how coping with international immobility often means taking stock of the disjunctures between one's future self and one's current progress in achieving such dreams within a particular view of time. The souring of migration aspirations signify how much is lost in the process of becoming a migrant, and perhaps future research can delve even deeper into how temporal subjectivities shape how individuals can return to former migration aspirations and restart efforts to build their capacity to leave the country.

More broadly, this paper reinforces current scholarship that emphasises how a sensitivity to time and temporalities can reveal the temporariness of individuals' migration aspirations and capabilities. Although recent years have seen growing interest in questions of temporality among migration scholars, such work continues to be largely centred on how time shapes people's mobility. This paper provides an empirical case on the potential of temporality as an approach to understanding how people choose to stay in place.

Notes

1 There is a growing literature on the 'mobility bias' in migration studies. Kerilyn Schewel's (2019) recent article discusses different perspectives on issue, as well as current gaps in the literature. Scholars have also pushed for a study of immobility through the concept of 'moorings' and its impact on individuals who are unable to realise their aspirations to move (see Hannam, Sheller, and Urry 2006).

2 There is a vast literature that investigates migration decisions beyond principles of neoclassical economics. Sociologists have talked about the culture of migration, where leaving the country is valorised as a natural part of the life course (Kandel and Massey 2002; Ali 2007). Others have also explored the impacts of place, which further complicates discussion on the cultures of migration (Thompson 2017; Robins 2019).

3 Two interviewees had been able to work overseas, but not as registered nurses. One had gone to Japan as a caregiver before pursuing a nursing degree, while another had spent two years in Singapore as a nursing aide at a home for elderly patients.

4 In a forthcoming article, we use Carling and Schewel's concept of 'adaptive preferences' to discuss how aspiring nurse migrants can subdue their original plans by seeking alternative destination countries (Saudi Arabia instead of the US) or other jobs beyond nursing (e.g. leaving as a caregiver).

5 There is a growing literature that investigates how time is composed of nonlinear, overlapping temporalities (Davies 2001) that provides varied meaning to different life projects (see Cwerner 2001). Much of this work builds on the writing of Lefebvre ([1992] 2004) who suggests that individuals live in the moment (present) and are actively linked to the past and future. Understanding time as relational underscores that different temporalities are not just categories, but may be actively pursued, experienced, and negotiated, as in our paper.

6 Studies have studied chain migration patterns among Filipino migrants in destination countries like the US (see Liu, Ong, and Rosenstein 1991; Aguilar 2009).

7 Parents' significant influence in career decision-making of their child can be traced from the traditional Filipino family norms of child's obedience to the parents' discipline (Medina 2001; Bernardo 2010). The feelings of obedience and obligation expressed by our interviewees is a trait known as the utang na loob or understood as having an eternal debt of gratitude for the support provided by the parents or guardians (Sustento-Seneriches 2000).

8 The first author's previous work had documented the experiences of nursing graduates who never became interested or invested in the nursing profession and only obtained the nursing degree to please parents or relatives. Many of these nursing graduates left the profession when they could not find gainful employment after graduation (see Ortiga 2018b). In this paper, interviewees had passed the board exams and spent considerable time and effort accumulating hospital experience. While parental influence was a big factor in choosing to major in Nursing, our interviewees made the decision to remain in the profession and work towards overseas jobs.

9 After 2015, countries such as Saudi Arabia and the UK began to loosen restrictions by only requiring a year of hospital experience. However, most of our interviewees still struggled to show proof of enough clinical experience because of their staggered employment history that resulted from the short-term employment contracts available in hospitals.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).
Additional information

Funding

This work was supported by Japan Society for the Promotion of Science: [Grant Number JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number 15H05171].

ORCID

Yasmin Y. Ortiga http://orcid.org/0000-0003-1740-0521
Romeo Luis A. Macabasag http://orcid.org/0000-0002-6229-6084

References

Acacio, Kristel. 2011. "Getting Nurses Here: Migration Industry and the Business of Connecting Philippine-Educated Nurses with United States Employers." PhD diss., University of California, Berkeley.

Aguilar, Filomeno V. 2009. Maalwang Buhay: Family, Overseas Migration, and Cultures of Relatedness in Barangay Paraiso. Philippines: Ateneo de Manila University Press.

Aiken, Linda H. 2007. "U.S. Nurse Labor Dynamics Are Key to Global Nurse Sufficiency." Health Services Research 42 (3): 1299–1322.

Ali, Syed. 2007. "'Go West Young Man': The Culture of Migration among Muslims in Hyderabad, India." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 33 (1): 37–58..

Alpes, Maybritt Jill. 2014. "Imagining a Future in 'Bush': Migration Aspirations at Times of Crisis in Anglophone Cameroon." Identities 21 (3): 259–274.

Amrith, Megha. 2020. "The Linear Imagination, Stalled: Changing Temporal Horizons in Migrant Journeys." Global Networks .

Anderson, Bridget. 2009. "What's in a Name? Immigration Controls and Subjectivities: The Case of Au Pairs and Domestic Worker Visa Holders in the UK." Subjectivity 29 (1): 407–424.

Andersson, Ruben. 2014. Illegality, Inc.: Clandestine Migration and the Business of Bordering Europe . Berkeley : University of California Press.

Baas, Michiel , and Brenda S. A. Yeoh . 2018. "Introduction: Migration Studies and Critical Temporalities." Current Sociology 67 (2): 161–168.

Bailey, Adrian J. , Richard A. Wright , Alison Mountz , and Ines M. Miyares . 2002. "(Re) producing Salvadoran Transnational Geographies." Annals of the Association of American Geographers 92 (1): 125–144.

Bernardo, Allan B. I. 2010. "Exploring Filipino Adolescents' Perceptions of the Legitimacy of Parental Authority Over Academic Behaviors." Journal of Applied Developmental Psychology 31: 273–280.

Buchan, James , Fiona O'May , and Gilles Dussault . 2013. "Nursing Workforce Policy and the Economic Crisis: A Global Overview." Journal of Nursing Scholarship 45 (3): 298–307.

Carling, Jørgen. 2002. "Migration in the Age of Involuntary Immobility: Theoretical Reflections and Cape Verdean Experiences." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 28 (1): 5–42.

Carling, Jørgen , and Francis Collins . 2018. "Aspiration, Desire and Drivers of Migration." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 44 (6): 909–926.

Carling, Jørgen , and Kerilyn Schewel . 2018. "Revisiting Aspiration and Ability in International Migration." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 44 (6): 945–963.

Castles, Stephen , Hein De Haas , and Mark J. Miller . 2013. The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World . 5th ed. London : Macmillan International Higher Education.

Choy, Catherine Ceniza. 2003. Empire of Care: Nursing and Migration in Filipino American History . Durham, NC : Duke University Press.

Chu, Julie Y. 2010. Cosmologies of Credit: Transnational Mobility and the Politics of Destination in China . Durham, NC : Duke University Press.

Cole, Jennifer. 2010. Sex and Salvation: Imagining the Future in Madagascar . Chicago : University of Chicago Press.

Collins, Francis L. 2017. "Desire as a Theory for Migration Studies: Temporality, Assemblage and Becoming in the Narratives of Migrants." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 44 (6): 964–980.

Conradson, David , and Deirdre McKay . 2007. "Translocal Subjectivities: Mobility, Connection, Emotion." Mobilities 2 (2): 167–174.

Creighton, Mathew J. 2013. "The Role of Aspirations in Domestic and International Migration." Social Science Journal 50 (1): 79–88.

Cwerner, Saulo B. 2001. "The Times of Migration." Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 27 (1): 7–36.

Davies, Karen. 2001. "Responsibility and Daily Life: Reflections Over Timespace." In Timespace: Geographies of Temporality, edited by J. May , and N. J. Thrift , 133–148. New York: Routledge.

De Haas, Hein. 2010. "Migration and Development: A Theoretical Perspective." The International Migration Review 44 (1): 227–264.

Folke, Jenny Nilsson. 2017. “Moving on or Moving Back? The Temporalities of Migrant Students’ Lived versus Imagined School Careers.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 44 (9): 1506–1522.

Frohlick, Susan. 2009. “Pathos of Love in Puerto Viejo, Costa Rica: Emotion, Travel and Migration.” Mobilities 4 (3): 389–405.

Griffiths, Melanie BE. 2014. “Out of Time: The Temporal Uncertainties of Refused Asylum Seekers and Immigration Detainees.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 40 (12): 1991–2009.

Griffiths, Melanie , Ali Rogers , and Bridget Anderson . 2013. “Migration, Time and Temporalities: Review and Prospect.” COMPAS Research Resources Paper. Centre on Migration, Policy and Society, University of Oxford.

Guevarra, Anna Romina. 2010. Marketing Dreams, Manufacturing Heroes: The Transnational Labor Brokering of Filipino Workers. Piscataway, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Hannam, Kevin, Mimi Sheller , and John Urry . 2006. “Editorial: Mobilities, Immobilities and Moorings.” Mobilities 1 (1): 1–22.

ICNM (International Centre on Nurse Migration). 2012. “The Impact of the Financial Crisis on Nurses and Nursing: A Comparative Overview of 34 European Countries.” ICNM News. Geneva, Switzerland: International Council of Nurses.

Jónsson, Gunvor. 2008. “Migration Aspirations and Immobility in a Malian Soninke Village.” Working Papers. International Migration Institute, University of Oxford.

Kandel, William, and Douglas S. Massey. 2002. “The Culture of Mexican Migration: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis.” Social Forces 80 (3): 981–1004.

Kara, Hanna. 2016. “The Making of Migrant Subjectivities: Time and Intersectionality in the Transnational Everyday Lives of Latin American Women in Barcelona.” PhD diss. University of Helsinki.

Kofman, Eleonore. 2004. “Family-Related Migration: A Critical Review of European Studies.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 30 (2): 243–262.

Lefebvre, Henri. (1992) 2004. Rhythmanalysis: Space, Time and Everyday Life. Reprint. New York: Continuum.

Liu, John M., Paul M. Ong, and Carolyn Rosenstein. 1991. “Dual Chain Migration: Post-1965 Filipino Immigration to the United States.” International Migration Review 25 (3): 487–513.

Mainwaring, Ċetta. 2016. “Migrant Agency: Negotiating Borders and Migration Controls.” Migration Studies 4 (3): 289–308.

Masselink, Leah E., and Shoou- Yih Daniel Lee. 2010. “Nurses, Inc.: Expansion and Commercialization of Nursing Education in the Philippines.” Social Science and Medicine 71 (1): 166–172.

Mata-Codesal, Diana. 2015. “Ways of Staying Put in Ecuador: Social and Embodied Experiences of Mobility–Immobility Interactions.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 41 (14): 2274–2290.

Mata-Codesal, Diana. 2017. “Gendered (im) mobility: Rooted Women and Waiting Penelopes.” Crossings: Journal of Migration & Culture 8 (2): 151–162.

McGeown, Kate. 2012. “Nursing Dream Turns Sour in the Philippines.” BBC, July 5. https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-18575810.

Medina, Belen Tan-Gatue. 2001. The Filipino Family. Philippines: University of the Philippines Press.

Meeus, Bruno. 2012. “How to ‘Catch’ Floating Populations? Research and the Fixing of Migration in Space and Time.” Ethnic and Racial Studies 35 (10): 1775–1793.

O’Kerry, Emma Rachel. 2017. “Precarious Temporality: A Study of Waiting in the UK Asylum System.” PhD diss., The University of Leeds.

Ortiga, Yasmin Y. 2014. “Professional Problems: The Burden of Producing the ‘Global’ Filipino Nurse.” Social Science & Medicine 115: 64–71.

Ortiga, Yasmin Y. 2018a. Emigration, Employability, and Higher Education in the Philippines. Abingdon, UK: Routledge.

Ortiga, Yasmin Y. 2018b. “Learning to Fill the Labor Niche: Aspiring Nurse Migrants Caught in a Migration Trap.” Russell Sage Foundation Journal of the Social Sciences 4 (1): 172–187.

Ortiga, Yasmin Y. 2020. “Shifting Employabilities: Skilling Migrants in the Nation of Emigration.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies.

Peñafiel, J. 2015. “Regulating Migration to Australia and Back to the Philippines: Applying a ‘Diaspora Strategies’ Framework.” Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography 36: 201–214.

Robertson, Shanthi. 2019. “Migrant, Interrupted: The Temporalities of ‘Staggered’ Migration from Asia to Australia.” Current Sociology 67 (2): 169–185.

Robertson, Shanthi, and Anjena Runganaikaloo . 2014. “Lives in Limbo: Migration Experiences in Australia’s Education–Migration Nexus.” Ethnicities 14 (2): 208–226.

Robins, Daniel. 2019. “Imagining London: The Role of the Geographical Imagination in Migrant Subjectivity and Decision-Making.” Area 51 (4): 728–735.

Ronquillo, Charlene, Geertje Boschma , Sabrina T. Wong , and Linda Quiney . 2011. “Beyond Greener Pastures: Exploring Contexts Surrounding Filipino Nurse Migration in Canada Through Oral History.” Nursing Inquiry 18 (3): 262–275.

Schewel, Kerilyn. 2015. “Understanding the Aspiration to Stay: A Case Study of Young Adults in Senegal.” International Migration Institute, University of Oxford.

Schewel, Kerilyn. 2019. “Understanding Immobility: Moving Beyond the Mobility Bias in Migration Studies.” International Migration Review 54 (2): 328–355.

Solomon, Feliz. 2020. “Coronavirus Heightens Global Struggle for Migrant Nurses.” The Wall Street Journal, April 29. https://www.wsj.com/articles/coronavirus-heightens-global-struggle-for-migrant-nurses-11588161393.

Stevens, Catriona. 2018. “Temporary Work, Permanent Visas and Circular Dreams: Temporal Disjunctures and Precarity among Chinese Migrants to Australia.” Current Sociology 67 (2): 294–314.

Sustento-Seneriches, Juliana. 2000. “Filipino American Families.” In Working with Asian Americans: A Guide for Clinicians, edited by Evelyn Lee, 101–113. New York: The Guilford Press.

Tabor, Aidan S., Taciano L. Milfont, and Colleen Ward. 2015. “International Migration Decision-Making and Destination Selection among Skilled Migrants.” Journal of Pacific Rim Psychology 9 (1): 28–41.

Thompson, Maddy. 2017. “Migration Decision-Making: A Geographical Imaginations Approach.” Area 49 (1): 77–84.

Thompson, Maddy. 2018. “Everything Changes to Stay the Same: Persistent Global Health Inequalities Amidst New Therapeutic Opportunities and Mobilities for Filipino Nurses.” Mobilities 14 (1): 38–53.

Thompson, Maddy, and Margaret Walton-Roberts. 2019. “International Nurse Migration from India and the Philippines: The Challenge of Meeting the Sustainable Development Goals in Training, Orderly Migration and Healthcare Worker Retention.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 45 (14): 2583–2599.

Vilog, Ron B. T., and Marie D. M. Ballesteros. 2015. “Overseas Filipino Workers in Conflict Zones: Narratives of Filipino Nurses in Libya.” Bandung: Journal of the Global South.

Walsh, Katie. 2009. “Geographies of the Heart in Transnational Spaces: Love and the Intimate Lives of British Migrants in Dubai.” Mobilities 4 (3): 427–445.

Walton-Roberts, Margaret. 2020. “Intermediaries and Transnational Regimes of Skill: Nursing Skills and Competencies in the Context of International Migration.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies.

Wang, Bingyu. 2020. “Time in Migration: Temporariness, Precarity and Temporal Labour Amongst Chinese Scholars Returning from the Global North to South.” Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 46 (11): 2127–2144.

Yeates, Nicola, and Jane Pillinger. 2019. International Health Worker Migration and Recruitment: Global Governance, Politics and Policy. New York: Routledge.