

Singapore Management University

## Institutional Knowledge at Singapore Management University

---

Research Collection School of Social Sciences

School of Social Sciences

---

12-2020

### Alternative education spaces and pathways: Insights from an international Christian school in China

Menusha DE SILVA

*National University of Singapore*

Orlando WOODS

*Singapore Management University, orlandowoods@smu.edu.sg*

Lily KONG

*Singapore Management University, lilykong@smu.edu.sg*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://ink.library.smu.edu.sg/sooss\\_research](https://ink.library.smu.edu.sg/sooss_research)



Part of the [Asian Studies Commons](#), and the [International and Comparative Education Commons](#)

---

#### Citation

DE SILVA, Menusha, WOODS, Orlando, & KONG, Lily.(2020). Alternative education spaces and pathways: Insights from an international Christian school in China. *Area*, 52(4), 750-757.

Available at: [https://ink.library.smu.edu.sg/sooss\\_research/3199](https://ink.library.smu.edu.sg/sooss_research/3199)

This Journal Article is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Social Sciences at Institutional Knowledge at Singapore Management University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Research Collection School of Social Sciences by an authorized administrator of Institutional Knowledge at Singapore Management University. For more information, please email [cherylds@smu.edu.sg](mailto:cherylds@smu.edu.sg).

**Alternative education spaces in China: The case of an international Christian school and its students' alternative higher education pathways**

|                  |  |
|------------------|--|
| Journal:         | <i>Area</i>  |
| Manuscript ID    | AREA-RP-Jun-2019-0051.R2   |
| Manuscript Type: | Regular Paper  |
| Keywords:        | alternative education spaces, China, cultural capital, international schools, faith-based schools, higher education  |
| Abstract:        | <p>The nascent scholarship on geographies of alternative education focuses on alternative education spaces, most located in the UK, that resist and/or negotiate neoliberal restructuring of education, some of which cater to socially marginalised groups. In contrast, through an ethnographic focus on an underground Christian international school in China, we examine an alternative education space that responds to parents' aspirations for their children to be inculcated with global cultural capital, Chinese values and Christian beliefs. These aspirations are not fulfilled in mainstream state schools or international schools in China, but are demanded by parents looking for a "superior" set of skills for their children to navigate the increasingly neoliberal, and global, higher education and employment landscapes. The discussion reveals the incongruities in the school's claim to simultaneously instil global, local and spiritual forms of cultural capital, which leads to two visions of the pathway to higher education. The paper expands the geographies of alternative education in three ways. First, it shows how international and faith-based schools can provide alternative schooling. Second, it shows how the departure of alternative education spaces from their mainstream counterparts can reveal the inadequacies of the latter. Third, it draws attention to how the cultural capital inculcated through alternative education can lead to alternative international higher education pathways within and beyond China.</p> |

SCHOLARONE™  
Manuscripts

## Introduction

Alternative education spaces offer students an alternative to mainstream, state-funded education by adopting unconventional curriculum, pedagogies, financing and/or physical layouts for the school and classrooms (Kraftl, 2014). The nascent literature on these spaces examines how certain schools, predominantly in the UK, negotiate the neoliberal restructuring of education, while at times addressing the needs of socially marginalised groups such as youths-at-risk (Kraftl, 2013; Gorman and Cacciato, 2017). Another characteristic of such scholarship is that it speaks from and to western contexts. **The scholarship's anglocentric focus leaves a significant gap in the understanding of alternative education space in terms of how milieus of other geographical regions create differing forms of the phenomenon.** Through the case of Pioneer Academy (pseudonym), an underground Christian international school in urban China<sup>1</sup>, this article explores how alternative education can be conceptualised in **a particular non-western context.**

Pioneer Academy is private, and is considered underground due to the explicit integration of Christianity into its curriculum despite the Chinese government deeming public evangelism, and the provision of religious education to children less than 18 years, illegal. By examining the particularities of Pioneer Academy, the article contributes to the literature on geographies of alternative education in three ways. **First, by examining the role played by international schools and faith-based schools in providing an alternative form of education.** Second, instead of focusing on formally recognised educational providers that challenge the promotion of state-sanctioned values, it highlights a scenario where the state restrictions lead to the creation of underground alternative education spaces. Third, it reveals how alternative education spaces lead to alternative pathways of higher education.

We start by reviewing the ways in which alternative education spaces are positioned within mainstream society and inculcate particular values in their students. **Through**

1  
2  
3 Bourdieu's (1986) notion of cultural capital, we discuss the manner in which global cultural  
4 capital and spiritual capital that are inculcated through international schools and faith-based  
5 schools respectively are dis(similar). We then outline the particularities of China's  
6  
7  
8 educational landscape and Pioneer Academy. Finally, we examine how Pioneer Academy  
9  
10 instils an alternative form of cultural capital which motivates its students and their parents to  
11  
12 seek alternative forms of higher education within and beyond China.  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18

### 19 **Expanding the scope of alternative education spaces**

20  
21 Through his work on geographies of alternative education in the UK, Kraftl (2013,  
22 p.238) reveals that alternative education spaces oppose and/or negotiate values associated  
23 with neoliberalism, and promote alternative "visions and versions of life-itself". Some  
24 schools work toward these ideals by cultivating dispositions such as being "open, welcoming,  
25 generous and responsible to strangers near and far" (Kraftl, 2013, p.251); qualities that are  
26 deemed to be stifled by standards-driven neoliberal practices of education, which emphasise  
27 instead competitiveness. Others focus on students who are marginalised within mainstream  
28 education such as economically-disadvantaged children, teenagers at risk, and persons with  
29 learning difficulties (Horton and Kraftl, 2009; Kraftl, 2016). However, Kraftl (2013)  
30 emphasizes that alternative education spaces in the UK do not function as separate entities,  
31 and reveals how their spatialities both connect and disconnect from mainstream education,  
32 society and life trajectories. For example, care farms – farming spaces that incorporate  
33 learning into therapy – have to negotiate between protecting their vulnerable clients and  
34 conveying openness to the public in order to gain financial support and recognition within the  
35 local community (Kraftl, 2013).  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54

55 The position an alternative education space occupies within a nation's educational  
56 landscape indicates the value placed on the cultural capital inculcated through its education,  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 which in turn signals its students' social position (Bourdieu, 1986). For instance, some care  
4 farms have considered a system of accreditation that would provide recognition for their  
5 students' skills within mainstream schools and the job market (Kraftl, 2013). These strategies  
6 are aimed at fostering a connection between marginalised groups and their local communities  
7 with the intention that they will eventually integrate into mainstream society. Waters and  
8 Brooks (2015) complicate this integrative understanding of alternative education spaces by  
9 foregrounding the separateness deliberately maintained by English elite boarding schools  
10 through geographical and symbolic isolation. This distinguishes its students as being distinct  
11 from – and implicitly superior to – those of mainstream schools. Within these spaces,  
12 students are inculcated with particular traits that would give them access to opportunities that  
13 are not accessible to others, and signals their privileged status within British society.  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27

28 Geographers have signalled how international schools and faith-based schools need  
29 more attention within the geographies of education (Kong, 2013). Although these educational  
30 spaces are rarely considered similar, the lens of alternative education brings their  
31 commonalities to the fore. Both maintain differing levels of geographical and symbolic  
32 distance from mainstream education, and aim to create individuals who are socially distinct  
33 from mainstream society. International education extends beyond national borders either by  
34 students moving abroad for studies, or “incorporating foreign ideas or ways of thinking into  
35 curriculum, diverging from a focus on the nation-state in which the school is located”  
36 (Young, 2018, p.159). Non-geographical studies reveal the tensions that emerge when  
37 international schools attempt to build more inter-cultural connections with the local  
38 communities they are situated in (Heyward, 2002), while also fearing the “possibility of a  
39 damaging ‘cultural clash’” due to their affinity with a distant or global community (Bunnell,  
40 2005, p.49). Faith-based schools are distinguishable by the extent to which religion is  
41 integrated into their curriculum. Similar to the alternative education spaces in UK that are not  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 wholly disconnected from mainstream education (Kraftl 2013), classifying a faith-based  
4 school as an alternative education space is dependent on, and reflective of, the local context  
5 (i.e. the extent to which religion is included in the cultural capital transferred through  
6 mainstream schools). Drawing largely on examples from the UK, geographers have  
7 interrogated the idea that faith-based schools promote alternative beliefs that are not aligned  
8 with broader societal values (Dwyer and Parutis, 2013; Hemming, 2011).  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16

17 However, international schools and faith-based schools diverge in terms of the value  
18 placed on the alternative cultural capital they inculcate; that of the former is greatly sought  
19 after, while the latter is frequently a point of contestation. Students of international schools  
20 are often privileged because of their Western education, cosmopolitan outlook and  
21 bilingualism, even though it is also acknowledged that they can account for feelings of  
22 rootlessness and alienation from cultures of their home country (Moore and Barker, 2012;  
23 Sears, 2011). Despite these drawbacks, this ‘global cultural capital’ is sought after to ensure  
24 better life opportunities and social mobility. In Asian countries an international education is  
25 deemed to provide a superior form of cultural capital in comparison to that inculcated  
26 through the local school system (Cheng, 2018). Waters and Leung (2017) observe how  
27 research on international education focuses on the experiences and mobilities of privileged  
28 expatriates. In comparison, the focus on non-elite locals who seek international qualifications  
29 as an alternative to mainstream education and the “the multiple and hybrid ways in which  
30 students are involved in international education” is lacking (Madge et al., 2015, p.683).  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48

49 Issues related to faith-based schools are examined in the context of globalization and  
50 immigration, where the state seeks to promote multiculturalism and a shared national  
51 identity. Although the cultural capital inculcated in these schools fosters a sense of belonging  
52 to a local and/or global religious community, they simultaneously align with state discourses  
53 of a shared national identity (Kong, 2005). Yet, neoliberal and secular ideologies promoted  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 through state policies and mainstream education are sometimes resisted by faith-based  
4 schools. Known in the U.S. as ‘cultural wars’ between liberal and conservative proponents,  
5  
6 some faith-based educational institutions have gained legal permission to teach creationism  
7  
8 as an alternative to evolution (Hemming, 2015). Further, Qian and Kong (2017, p.807) reveal  
9  
10 how a Christian faith-school in Hong Kong engages in both “overt resistance” and “flexible  
11  
12 accommodation” to negotiate the state’s neoliberal restructuring of education. These  
13  
14 negotiations highlight faith-based schools’ anxieties about the promotion of secular values,  
15  
16 which would undermine the ‘spiritual capital’ these schools attempt to inculcate in their  
17  
18 students; that is, the “source of empowerment [...and] guide [of] judgement and action in the  
19  
20 mundane world” (Grace, 2010, p.119).  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

26 **Admittedly in these studies, the faith-based schools’ departure from mainstream**  
27 **education are not as prominent as in the case of international schools.** These (dis)connections  
28  
29 are shaped by the state’s policies towards religious education and the level at which faith-  
30  
31 based schools are funded. Therefore, alternative cultural capital and visions of the future  
32  
33 transferred through these schools tend to be nuanced and circumscribed by the state.  
34  
35 **However, exploring faith-based schools in countries where religious-education is not funded**  
36  
37 **(France), or prohibited (China), would offer novel conceptualisations of alternative education**  
38  
39 **spaces, including the intersection of international and faith-based schools.**  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44

45 **Given the emergent nature of the geographies of alternative education, the**  
46  
47 **intertwining of work on international schools or faith-based schools, presents opportunities to**  
48  
49 **expand this scholarship in two ways.** First, existing work demonstrates the ways in which  
50  
51 formally recognised alternative schools are positioned within the broader educational  
52  
53 landscape and attempt to resist neoliberal restructuring. In contrast, Pioneer Academy is  
54  
55 hidden from the national educational landscape and aligns with neoliberal ideals of  
56  
57 inculcating students with global cultural capital. Second, the scholarship signals that  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 alternative education enables its students to change their social position by gaining cultural  
4 capital that would give them elite status (Waters and Brooks, 2015) or progress from their  
5 marginalised position and be better integrated with mainstream society (Kraftl, 2013).  
6  
7

8  
9  
10 However, few studies explicitly focus on how the students' alternative cultural capital shape  
11 their aspirations and (potential) lifepaths. Therefore, we examine how a Christian  
12 international school inculcates its students with a particular brand of cultural capital that is  
13 simultaneously desired and frowned upon by Chinese mainstream society, and which  
14 motivates its students to pursue alternative pathways to international higher education.  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

### 24 **The place of alternative education in China's educational landscape**

25  
26 Due to China's shift from socialism to a market economy since the 1990s, educational  
27 policies have attempted to strike a balance between inculcating students with "Western ideas  
28 of independent and free civil personalities" and "the virtue-centred Chinese traditional  
29 education" (Zhu and Feng, 2008, p.6). The present-day educational system is highly  
30 standardized where mainstream schools in China adhere to a curriculum regulated by the  
31 central government and students must sit for competitive entrance examinations to qualify for  
32 higher education (Young, 2018). Dissatisfactions with the competitive mainstream education  
33 system and the recent emphasis on "21st century skills" have increased the popularity of  
34 international schools among the local population and led to a diversification of the types of  
35 international schools available in China. International schools with curricula that provide  
36 entry into North American and West European universities (e.g. Advanced Placement and  
37 International Baccalaureate Diploma programmes) are perceived as better equipped to teach  
38 students the skills necessary to navigate a globalised world (Wright and Lee, 2014). The  
39 expansion of the private international schooling sector is curtailed by its high fees and the  
40 government's policy that restricts Chinese nationals from attending these schools (Wright and  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60



1  
2  
3 Lee, 2014). Since only a few state schools offer an international curriculum, elite Chinese  
4  
5 nationals and children of expatriates represent a privileged minority within Chinese society.  
6  
7 Colloquially, the international education system is called the ‘international exit solution’,  
8  
9 where students forego the chance of entering Chinese universities, and opt for international  
10  
11 higher education instead (Schulte, 2018).  
12  
13

14  
15 Given these restrictions to accessing global cultural capital, many Chinese seek  
16  
17 alternative avenues for an international education, despite these schools’ “muddy legal  
18  
19 status” (Young, 2018, p.160). Some international schools offer baseline educational  
20  
21 qualifications to children of internal migrants who, though affluent, lack an equally important  
22  
23 indicator of social status in China – an ‘urban’ local household registration, or *hukou* (Young,  
24  
25 2018). Due to China’s decentralized fiscal and education system, rural-to-urban migrants’  
26  
27 children face difficulties in accessing free compulsory education in destination cities, and a  
28  
29 significant body of work examines underground schools that cater for low-income children  
30  
31 (see Yuan et al., 2017 for a review). These schools are unlicensed, private, migrant-run  
32  
33 schools that are housed in dilapidated buildings. Although these schools attempt to follow  
34  
35 mainstream schools’ curricula, they are challenged by poor facilities and inexperienced  
36  
37 teachers. In comparison, studies that examine schools that are covert due to their religious  
38  
39 affiliations, and the future pathways they may pursue, are rare.  
40  
41  
42  
43

44  
45 Since the late 19th century, religious beliefs have been constructed as an obstruction  
46  
47 to China’s modernizing projects (Cao, 2018). This secular ideology remains predominant  
48  
49 within Chinese society. However, the state has removed restrictions on the practice of  
50  
51 selected religions, i.e. Buddhism, Daoism, Islam, Protestantism, and Catholicism, due to their  
52  
53 diplomatic value and perceived benefits for the country’s economic development (Sun,  
54  
55 2017). Despite being sanctioned, religious activities are restricted to the premises of  
56  
57 registered religious institutions. Yet, in reality, many religious practices and gatherings occur  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 underground; for example, McDonald's restaurants have been identified as clandestine  
4 meeting places for Bible study (Yang, 2005) and house-churches are a growing trend  
5  
6 (Bregnbæk, 2018). Since the Chinese government bans religious education to children under  
7  
8 18 years, Christian churches are prohibited from conducting Sunday school (Sun, 2017).  
9

10  
11  
12 Pioneer Academy is considered an international school because it offers the Advanced  
13 Placement programme that sets the students on the path of pursuing tertiary-level education  
14 in American and Canadian institutions. Most former students of Pioneer Academy have  
15 migrated to the U.S., Canada and Hong Kong. Its curriculum is based on home-schooling  
16 textbooks, which are published by the John Paul University (pseudonym), a private  
17 evangelical university in the US. The school is registered as a business and occupies several  
18 floors of a business complex. Since its establishment in 2007, Pioneer Academy has  
19 expanded to 140 students and 40 teachers, and its principal plans to build another campus in  
20 the region. While 90% of the students are Chinese citizens, the school attracts expatriates of  
21 Chinese-descent (from Hong Kong) and from other countries, such as Ethiopia.  
22  
23 Approximately two-thirds of the teachers are Chinese, while the remainder are Americans.  
24 Since the institution identifies as a Christian school, only Christians are recruited as teachers;  
25 70% of students adhere to the Christian faith.  
26  
27

28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42 This case study is drawn from a larger project on international education in China,  
43 which was conducted in 2015. Pioneer Academy was identified through networks developed  
44 in the field. The paper is based on interviews with the principal and focus group discussions  
45 with eight students, four teachers, and four parents, as well as an examination of the teaching  
46 materials used, and observations of school activities. Since the researcher was permitted to  
47 interview a limited number of students and teachers, researching the underground school was  
48 challenging. Some students were reluctant to have their responses recorded; on these  
49 occasions, notes were taken. Pseudonyms are used throughout.  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

### **From alternative education to alternative visions of life**

According to the principal of Pioneer Academy, Hong, and the parents who were interviewed, the institution's curriculum that inculcated global, local and spiritual forms of cultural capital distinguished it from other mainstream and international schools in the region. They explained that global cultural capital is not instilled adequately in Chinese mainstream schools and an international curriculum is most suited to the task (Young, 2018). Hong opined that learning in Chinese is a drawback in a globalised environment, and gives priority to teaching students to speak "English as if it's their mother tongue". Although these parents avoided placing their children in mainstream schools due to the desire for their children to be equipped with global skills, they also voiced concerns that an alternative education may not adequately inculcate their children with Chinese values and culture. Hong shared similar concerns about being "utterly American [and not] unswervingly Chinese" and explains that Pioneer Academy's "unique bilingual approach" is expected to develop its students' local cultural capital as well.

The parents conveyed that the priority given to spiritual development was Pioneer Academy's greatest attraction, and addressed a need that both mainstream and international schools in China fail to provide. They explained that due to the competitiveness promoted within local schools, "character building... [is] completely absent, or even counter-productive" (Shen, parent). Although these parents are affluent, they signalled a distinction between Pioneer Academy and international schools that cater for expatriates' children. In Chan's (parent's) words: "other international schools enrol children from privileged or rich families, so we worry about the school ethos and discipline; in those schools, it's a bit anarchic." These parents' tendency to view evangelical Christianity as solution to the "moral vacuum" and "feeling of an inner emptiness as a result of the constant striving for outer

1  
2  
3 success” resonates with research on Chinese working-age youth (Bregnbæk, 2018, p.180).  
4

5  
6 Despite Pioneer Academy’s claim of transferring two different forms of cultural capital,  
7  
8 its curricula privileges inculcating global cultural capital. Contrary to its philosophy of  
9  
10 celebrating Chinese culture and Confucian values, the school gives precedence to  
11  
12 familiarising students with American culture. As Hong explained: “in each semester, we hold  
13  
14 many activities, which to many Chinese kids are unheard of; we’d have a Thanksgiving  
15  
16 lunch, for example”. The classroom activities, such as dressing up as characters from  
17  
18 Western fiction (e.g. Peter Pan, Harry Potter and Scarlet O’Hara) and watching Western  
19  
20 movies, also contribute to a deeper understanding of Western/American culture and social  
21  
22 norms. American teachers shared that a significant part of their teaching aimed at addressing  
23  
24 their students’ lack of familiarity with American culture that affected their grasp of the  
25  
26 subject matter. In the context of teaching a novel, set in the 1960s Midwest, Marilyn (teacher)  
27  
28 explained:  
29  
30  
31

32  
33 These girls are from Ethiopia, China, Hong Kong, so their background experience is  
34  
35 not going to be the same as an American student’s [...] Grade 7 kids have no idea  
36  
37 about the Midwest.  
38

39  
40 She remedies her students’ lack of exposure by showing them video clips of Elvis Presley  
41  
42 and fashions and expressions of the 1960s. In comparison to the holistic manner of learning  
43  
44 about American culture, an understanding of Chinese culture is developed through classroom  
45  
46 lessons on Chinese language, geography and history. The desire to balance the acquisition of  
47  
48 global (interpreted as American) and local cultural understanding is, in practice, not  
49  
50 evidenced in the educational approach, perhaps because of an assumption that the family  
51  
52 context and pre-school upbringing would have provided the Chinese cultural exposure for the  
53  
54 students of Chinese origin. Therefore, the cultural capital of Pioneer Academy’s students is  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 better aligned with students of American public schools than with their peers from local  
4  
5 schools.  
6

7  
8 The challenges of inculcating local cultural capital are compounded by Pioneer  
9  
10 Academy's covert position within the nation's educational landscape. Within Chinese  
11  
12 mainstream schools, 'patriotic education' has a significant influence on its students' identity  
13  
14 and sense of belonging, and views about cultural heritage and foreign relations (Wang, 2008).  
15  
16 Patriotic education is supplemented with state-sponsored cultural heritage fieldtrips and  
17  
18 educational competitions (Walton, 2018). As an unregistered educational institution, Pioneer  
19  
20 Academy is unable to tap into this holistic way of inculcating local cultural capital in its  
21  
22 students.  
23  
24

25  
26 Moreover, the principal's integration of Confucianism and Christianity, which is in  
27  
28 stark contrast to the predominantly secular ideologies promoted by the state, further alienates  
29  
30 its students from their local community. This spiritual capital is cultivated through the  
31  
32 school's Bible-based Christian curriculum, Bible lessons and prayer. Further, the teacher's  
33  
34 training programme reinforces this Christian mindset through topics titled 'Confucianism and  
35  
36 Christianity' and 'Thinking in God's Way'. As Hong justifies, "we are a Christian school, our  
37  
38 teachers need to know how to integrate God into everything." Notably, neither the parents  
39  
40 nor the principal commented on the illegality of providing religious education and the  
41  
42 challenges students might face when integrating into mainstream society with such  
43  
44 alternative cultural capital.  
45  
46  
47

48  
49 Indeed, the students' aspiration to pursue undergraduate degrees abroad, and their  
50  
51 parents and educators' interest in seeking opportunities for alternative international higher  
52  
53 education within China highlight this disjuncture. None of the students who were interviewed  
54  
55 expressed an aspiration to pursue higher education and/or employment in China. They shared  
56  
57 their intentions to study in American colleges and universities, particularly those that  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 identified as Christian institutions. The students' preference for these pathways to  
4  
5 international higher education is shaped by three factors; their inability to apply to local  
6  
7 universities, the cultural capital the students are inculcated with at Pioneer Academy and the  
8  
9 school's strategy of introducing avenues to pursue higher studies in Christian universities in  
10  
11 the U.S. Pioneer Academy's isolation from the predominantly secular local community and  
12  
13 its intensive transfer of spiritual capital influences its students' visions of their future. For  
14  
15 example, Izara (Ethiopian, student) explained how she has fostered a sense of belonging to a  
16  
17 global Christian community, which can help allay the anxieties of studying abroad:  
18  
19

20  
21 I think the Christian environment is a very comforting thought because [...] when  
22  
23 you talk about university it's a scary kind of thought, so maybe the Christian  
24  
25 environment will provide comfort.  
26  
27

28  
29 The spiritual cultural capital that alienates students from their local community is conversely  
30  
31 what the students seek to draw on in adapting to a for  
32  
33 eign university setting. So strong is the inculcation of spiritual capital that none of the  
34  
35 students interviewed aspired for global opportunities through secular educational institutions.  
36  
37 A similar pattern is observed by Bregnbæk (2018) where the combined effect of competition  
38  
39 within Chinese society, the solace offered through evangelical house churches and the  
40  
41 restriction on attending these churches result in young Chinese Christians longing for a better  
42  
43 life abroad. The students' preference is encouraged by Pioneer Academy's ability to provide  
44  
45 them with networks to tap into Christian universities in the U.S., e.g. through talks by the  
46  
47 president of the John Paul University. Notably, this private evangelical university publishes  
48  
49 the textbooks used by Pioneer Academy, which reveals the emergence of a transnational  
50  
51 space of alternative education rooted in shared values (Longhurst, 2013).  
52  
53  
54

55  
56 Despite the students' alternative educational and cultural capital, some parents and  
57  
58 teachers expressed desire for the students to remain in China while pursuing international  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 higher education through brand campuses of foreign universities. Indeed, Wu, a Chinese  
4 teacher at Pioneer Academy, expressed a desire for “Hong’s students [to] go to good  
5 universities right here in China”. These two territorialised visions of alternative international  
6 higher education are shaped by the differing subject positions occupied by Pioneer  
7 Academy’s students, and their parents and teachers. The students’ relative disconnection with  
8 the local cultural milieu, coupled with the privileging of global cultural (and spiritual) capital,  
9 has enlarged, but ironically also limited, their aspirations to attend faith-based international  
10 universities. In contrast, parents and teachers convey a preference for the students to be  
11 global-ready individuals who remain within China.  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

## 26 **Conclusions**

27  
28 Alternative education spaces defy straightforward definitions due to the complex ways in  
29 which they both align with, and deviate from, state-funded, mainstream education spaces, and  
30 the way in which local-contexts shape the understanding of what constitutes alternative  
31 education. By exploring the case of an underground Christian international school in urban  
32 China, this article expands the scope of alternative education spaces and examines the  
33 alternative versions of life its students adopt. **In addition, it expands the empirical focus of the**  
34 **scholarship that is largely based on the UK experience.** The paper offers three contributions  
35 to the geographies of alternative education.  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45

46  
47 **First, the paper interrogates how the intertwining of characteristics associated with**  
48 **international and faith-based schools create an alternative education space.** International  
49 schools are alternatives to mainstream education because they offer curricula that are not  
50 accessible through the local school system. The extent to which a faith-based school is  
51 considered as alternative education space is dependent on the level of religious education  
52 transferred through the country’s mainstream education. Pioneer Academy offers a rare  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

1  
2  
3 intersection of these two forms of alternative schools where its students are provided the  
4 highly sought global cultural capital while being inculcated with Christian values, which is  
5 prohibited by the Chinese state.  
6  
7  
8  
9

10 Second, it illustrates a departure from the existing work geographies of alternative  
11 education, which focus on spaces that negotiate the boundaries between them and mainstream  
12 schools by projecting either a sense of openness (Kraftl, 2013) or separateness (Brooks and  
13 Waters, 2015). The case of Pioneer Academy offers covertness as another manifestation of  
14 alternative education spaces. Most alternative education spaces promote particular ideals or  
15 alternative visions of life through its engagement and attempts at reducing the distance with  
16 the local community (Kraftl, 2014). This is precluded for an underground school. Instead, a  
17 covert alternative education space fundamentally signals the inadequacies of, and a radical  
18 departure from, mainstream education.  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29

30 Third, the article reveals how these inadequacies also lead to alternative pathways of  
31 higher education. Even while Pioneer Academy instils global cultural capital and spiritual  
32 capital in its students, it simultaneously generates a loss of local cultural capital. This tension  
33 is manifest in the students' sense of belonging to a global Christian community and their  
34 aspirations to pursue higher education in (evangelical) Christian universities in the U.S.  
35 Ironically, their vision of an alternative future contradicts with their parents and educators'  
36 territorialised notion of alternative higher education, which is to be rooted in China and study  
37 in relatively more secular international branch universities.  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50

### 51 **Endnotes**

- 52 1. Given the sensitivity of the topic, we have chosen not to name the city in which our  
53 fieldwork was conducted.  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60



## References

- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of social capital. In J. G. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (pp. 241-258). New York: Greenwood Press.
- Bregnbæk, S. (2018). In search of the heart of a heartless world: Chinese youth, house-church Christianity and the longing for foreign Utopias. *Identities*, 25, 176-191. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2017.1400277>
- Bunnell, T. (2005). Perspectives on international schools and the nature and extent of local community contact. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 4, 43-63. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1475240905050290>
- Cao, N. (2018). Chinese Religions on the Edge: Shifting Religion-State Dynamics. *China Review*, 18, 1-10. [muse.jhu.edu/article/711036](http://muse.jhu.edu/article/711036).
- Cheng, Y. E. (2018). Educated non-elites' pathways to cosmopolitanism: the case of private degree students in Singapore. *Social & Cultural Geography*, 19, 151-170. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14649365.2016.1266026>
- Dwyer, C., and Parutis, V. (2013). 'Faith in the system?' State-funded faith schools in England and the contested parameters of community cohesion. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 38(2), 267-284. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2012.00518.x>
- Gorman, R., and Cacciatore, J. (2017). Cultivating our humanity: A systematic review of care farming and traumatic grief. *Health and place*, 47, 12-21. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthplace.2017.06.006>
- Grace, G. (2010). Renewing spiritual capital: An urgent priority for the future of Catholic education internationally. *International Studies in Catholic Education*, 2, 117-128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19422539.2010.504017>
- Hemming, P. (2011) Educating for religious citizenship: multiculturalism and national identity in an English multi-faith primary school. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 36, 441- 454. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2011.00432.x>
- Hemming, P. J. (2015). Geographies of Faith in Education. In Brunn, S. D. (Ed.), *The Changing World Religion Map: Sacred places, identities, practices and politics*. (pp. 877-891). Springer.
- Heyward, M. (2002) From international to intercultural: Redefining the international school for a globalized world. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 1, 9-32. <https://doi.org/10.1177/147524090211002>
- Horton, J., and Kraftl, P. (2009). Small acts, kind words and “not too much fuss”: Implicit activism. *Emotion, Space and Society*, 2, 14-23. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emospa.2009.05.003>
- Kong, L. (2005). Religious schools: for spirit, (f)or nation. *Environment and Planning D:*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60

*Society and Space*, 23, 615-631. <https://doi.org/10.1068/d394>

Kong, L. (2013). Balancing spirituality and secularism, globalism and nationalism: The geographies of identity, integration and citizenship in schools. *Journal of Cultural Geography*, 30, 276-307. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08873631.2013.834120>

Kraftl, P. (2013). *Geographies of Alternative Education: Diverse learning spaces for children and young people*. Bristol: Policy Press.

Kraftl, P. (2014). What are alternative education spaces— and why do they matter? *Geography*, 99, 128-138. <http://hdl.handle.net/2381/32981>

Kraftl, P. (2016). The force of habit: channelling young bodies at alternative education spaces. *Critical Studies in Education*, 57, 116-130. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17508487.2016.1102753>

Longhurst, N. (2013). The emergence of an alternative milieu: conceptualising the nature of alternative places. *Environment and Planning A*, 45, 2100-2119. <https://doi.org/10.1068/a45487>

Madge, C., Raghuram, P., and Noxolo, P. (2015). Conceptualizing international education: From international student to international study. *Progress in Human Geography*, 39(6), 681-701. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0309132514526442>

Moore, A. M., and Barker, G. G. (2012). Confused or multicultural: Third culture individuals' cultural identity. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 36, 553-562. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2011.11.002>

Qian, J., and Kong, L. (2018). When secular universalism meets pluralism: Religious schools and the politics of school-based management in Hong Kong. *Annals of the American Association of Geographers*, 108, 794-810. <https://doi.org/10.1080/24694452.2017.1372175>

Schulte, B. (2018). Allies and competitors: Private schools and the state in China. In Steiner-Khamsi, G. and Draxler, A. (Eds.), *The State, Business and Education: Public-Private Partnerships Revisited* (pp. 68-84). Edward Elgar Publishing.

Sears, C. (2011). Integrating multiple identities: Narrative in the formation and maintenance of the self in international school students. *Journal of Research in International Education*, 10, 71-86. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1475240911399262>

Sun, Y. (2017). The rise of Protestantism in post-Mao China: State and religion in historical perspective. *American Journal of Sociology*, 122, 1664-1725. <https://doi.org/10.1086/691718>

Walton, L. (2018). The “Spirit” of Confucian Education in Contemporary China: Songyang Academy and Zhengzhou University. *Modern China*, 44, 313-342. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0097700417744165>

Wang, Z. (2008). National humiliation, history education, and the politics of historical memory: Patriotic education campaign in China. *International Studies Quarterly*, 52, 783-806. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2478.2008.00526.x>

1  
2  
3  
4 Waters, J., and Brooks, R. (2015). 'The magical operations of separation': English elite  
5 schools' on-line geographies, internationalisation and functional isolation. *Geoforum*, 58, 86-  
6 94. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2014.10.010>  
7

8  
9 Waters, J. L., & Leung, M. W. (2017). Domesticating transnational education: discourses of  
10 social value, self-worth and the institutionalisation of failure in 'meritocratic' Hong Kong.  
11 *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 42, 233-245.  
12 <https://doi.org/10.1111/tran.12163>  
13

14  
15 Wright, E., and Lee, M. (2014). Elite International Baccalaureate Diploma Programme  
16 schools and inter-cultural understanding in China. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 62,  
17 149-169. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00071005.2014.924615>  
18

19  
20 Yang, F. (2005). Lost in the market, saved at McDonald's: Conversion to Christianity in  
21 urban China. *Journal for the scientific study of religion*, 44, 423-441.  
22 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5906.2005.00295.x>  
23

24  
25 Young, N. A. (2018). Departing from the beaten path: international schools in China as a  
26 response to discrimination and academic failure in the Chinese educational system.  
27 *Comparative Education*, 54, 159-180. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03050068.2017.1360566>  
28

29  
30 Yuan, S., Noblit, G. W., and Rong, X. L. (2017). The education issues of the children of  
31 internal migrant workers in China. In Pink, W. T., and Noblit, G. W. (Eds.), *Second*  
32 *International Handbook of Urban Education* (pp. 113-132). Springer.

33  
34 Zhu, X., and Feng, X. (2008). On the development of citizenship education outlook in China.  
35 *Frontiers of Education in China*, 3, 1-21. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11516-008-0001-y>  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60